

ETHNIC GROUPS REVIEW- ARCHDIOCESE OF WELLINGTON

18 July 2022

INTRODUCTION

By Monsignor Gerard Burns, Vicar General, Head of Review

g.burns@wn.catholic.org.nz

The 2017 Archdiocesan Synod had a theme of Mission (Go, you are sent/Haere, tukuna). The Synod sought to use a methodology of prayerful discernment and produced a list of directions and priorities for different areas of Church life and action. Section 6 was titled: 'Go, you are sent.... as members of one body. There were 6 recommendations.

- a) The Archbishop reviews the place and scope of ethnic chaplaincies in the Archdiocese.
- b) The role of ethnic chaplaincies is fully defined and communicated.
- c) Consideration is given to having "mixed" chaplaincy teams which include both younger people and older people.
- d) Opportunities are created for migrants to tell their stories.
- e) Parish leadership and mission statements reflect the ethnic diversity of the community.
- f) Parish liturgies and activities involve and reflect their ethnic communities.

The background to this topic of reflection is not stated but probably there were 3 considerations in play behind this request. One is the evidence of the growing variety in the ethnic backgrounds of parishioners on Sunday and weekday Mass in the last 20 years. Another is the role of the ethnic and migrant chaplaincies both in providing Masses or sacramental opportunities in the language and/or style of ethnic groups and the impact on general parish communities. A third element would be the question of how to provide pastoral care for the various communities, what would be the models of pastoral care, and whether that would involve looking for clergy from the various ethnicities' countries of origin.

This survey has been conducted to get a better idea of the numbers of Catholics we are speaking of to make some projections. The resources of time, money, and personnel available have been very limited and so, of necessity, the scope of the survey has been limited and carried out very much part-time. Mons. Gerard Burns, as Vicar-General and working both in Māori pastoral care and in Spanish-speaking chaplaincy, has overseen the project. Maya Bernardo, of the Church Mission office and coordinator of Launch Out training, brought her academic and data analysis skills and coordinated with various parishes, chaplaincies, and ethnic groups to seek the raw data.

The benchmark for this kind of work in the Church in Aotearoa New Zealand is the work of Fr Gerald Arbuckle, SM, and John Faisandier, with their monumental 'The Church in a Multicultural Society'. That was particularly concerned with the Church's response to the Polynesian migration to this country but involved a year's work and a professional anthropologist. Of course, measurement of intercultural relations, attitudes, and practices depend on definitions of culture, ethnicity, race, and

a clear definition of the values, standards, and models against which attitudes and practices are being measured.

As this survey is being conducted for the Archdiocese of Wellington some of these values and standards are obviously those of the Gospel of Jesus Christ as evidenced in the scriptures and official teaching of the Church, especially statements on questions of racism, the importance of culture, dialogue, and questions of migration. Also in play are the understandings of policies of assimilation, integration, and the growing conversation around interculturality.

The policy of the Archdiocese since the time of the Arbuckle report has been that of integration of migrants. That is, rather than migrants being forced to assimilate to any pre-existing dominant culture, their culture is welcome and recognised. How this actually takes place in a given parish or country may vary and change. In recent years, the thinking around interculturality has expanded as a way of recognising the relationship that occurs among culturally diverse individuals or groups and the possibility of generating shared cultural expressions through dialogue and mutual respect (UNESCO).

Interculturality is something of a rejection of a passive acceptance of a multicultural or multi-ethnic presence in an area or in a country (and in some places multi-culturalism is seen as affirming segregation of ethnicities that have isolated themselves and emphasised their specificity). Interculturality emphasises the possibility of common human needs, the possibilities of dialogue and understanding across cultures, and the idea that no culture or cultural group is monolithic or unchanging. As Arbuckle emphasised (1976) cultures are in constant change and movement according to changing situations, location, and social and technological challenges.

Below are three over-arching challenges which the Ethnic Review poses. Please note that without presuming that European-Pākeha ethnic identity is the norm for ethnic identity in NZ we do acknowledge that grouping is the largest ethnic group in NZ currently. As the most numerous groups, we have not explored their ethnic identity. We have also not explored the participation of Māori in Church life as we do not see Māori as just 'one more' ethnic group but as the Indigenous people of the country and because of the effect of colonisation on Māori such an exploration requires full participation, co-design and a degree of expertise that is beyond our capacity.

1. Are the Archdiocese and its parishes seriously recognising the presence of increased ethnic diversity in parishes and Church institutions?

26% of Catholics (15 years and older) in the ADW identify themselves as belonging to an ethnic group. 69% of them are born overseas and 75% are aged 60 and below. The study is limited in making a reliable forecast of the Catholic population in ADW, but the findings suggest a future where the ADW will have a more even distribution of ethnicities instead of having one ethnicity making up over half of the population (i.e., 65% Pakeha). Current large groupings (Samoans, Filipinos) will remain the biggest of the ethnic groups. Much will depend on Aotearoa's future immigration policies but, in the future, Church membership and participants will be more ethnically diverse with consequent diversity of devotional, ecclesiological, and theological views and practices. How people of various backgrounds become part of the parish community will vary according to the cultural background and the welcome found in the parish. Working with community leaders is essential when offering pastoral care to all but it is likely those raised in New Zealand who will be the ones best able to act as cultural translators and more integrated perspectives. However, there is evidence that many of the youth and young adults of ethnic groups leave the Church for other denominations that they find more 'dynamic and youth-friendly, whilst some slip into the mainstream secular perspectives of New Zealand Society.

2. The role of parish priests and parish communities is essential for the spiritual welfare and social integration of new migrants.

The study suggests that the Church plays a significant role in integrating ethnic Catholics into Aotearoa, New Zealand. Many participants shared that the parish, a religious group, or a Catholic organisation such as the Vinnies have been instrumental in their settlement. Some interviewees also shared that when they first came to New Zealand, the first thing they looked for was the Church. Although they still struggle with English, the mass ritual is familiar to them and connects them to an important part of their cultural identity (especially for those who came as devout Catholics). The ethnic group/communities also provide the social and economic support new arrivals to New Zealand need (e.g., teaching them how to drive, open a bank account, look for a school for their children, find a job, etc.). The survey shows a strong positive relationship between the participants feeling integrated into New Zealand society and their feelings of being welcomed by their parishes.

3. Organisational change needed in diocesan support structures.

In terms of their relationship with the diocese, aside from the Samoan and Filipino communities who have their more-official chaplaincies, other ethnic communities rely on the voluntary or part-time pastoral care of former missionary priests like Frs. Gerard Burns and Fr. Donald Hornsey or priests who volunteer for Masses even though they are not fluent in the group's language (e.g., for the Indonesian community). The Fijians (multicultural group) rely on Sr Josefa Tikoilosolome and Columban Fr. Tom Rouse. Some international priests regularly celebrate mass for ethnic groups, such as Fr Biju and Fr Joy, who celebrate mass for the Syro-Malabar community. Most ethnic Catholics are involved in their parishes and rely on the parishes for all their sacramental needs. Both the Samoan and Filipino chaplaincy have strongly encouraged their members to prioritise their parishes over the chaplaincies. Most ethnic groups are self-reliant in keeping their communities going with minimal interaction with ADW. Examples of these lay-driven initiatives are the radio broadcasting segment that airs Catholic prayers in the Indigenous Fijian language and a Facebook page managed by Elisapeci Samanunu for the Indigenous Fijians. The Indonesian community organise their masses and gatherings. The Assyrians operate the same as a parish, with its priest and way of managing its affairs. They coordinate with the parishes to use the church building for their big masses and gatherings.

However, there are areas like the Marlborough region where there is little support. In an interview conducted, there are only two active Samoans in the parish, but the government census for the Marlborough region posted 39 Samoan Catholics (there could be more because of the vineyard seasonal workers) but are currently worshipping in other Christian churches that have Samoan pastors and hold services in the Samoan language. Other Christian denominations also provide transport support for vineyard workers to go to the services.

Auxiliary to these findings is that 90% of Ethnic Catholics are not involved in national Catholic organisations. This may point to an insular view of the Church that is limited to Wellington, their parish, and their Ethnic Group/ Community but with little affinity for the global Church, as one interviewee explains that 'they love everything about the Pope, even if we don't know what the Pope is saying' which could mean ambivalence on whatever is

coming out of the Vatican but would follow anything that the Pope wants as communicated through the priests or church leaders. Hence, missing out on the spiritual nourishment coming from the wisdom of Pope Francis and the movements in the global Church.

During the pandemic, many if not all ethnic groups have turned to online masses and resources from their homeland, which could further encourage an insular view of the Church.

There are recommendations from the interviews requesting for the leaders of ethnic groups to meet with other groups, for the diocese to regularly get in touch with them, and to be part of diocesan events. There is a slight leaning among ethnic Catholics to want to be more involved in the diocese. Given the present and future presence of diverse ethnic groups in the ADW, we recommend that the ADW be more intentional across its diocesan organisation to be more frequently in contact with these groups and shape its practice accordingly.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

By Maya Bernardo, Researcher
m.bernardo@wn.catholic.org.nz

OVERVIEW

- **RATIONALE:** The Review responded to the Synod's decision that "The Archbishop reviews the place and scope of ethnic chaplaincies in the Archdiocese" (Archdiocesan Synod 2017 Directions and Priorities 6a). The Review will enable the Archdiocese to respond to the Synod's decision of "*The role of ethnic chaplaincies is fully defined and communicated*" (Directions and Priorities 6b) and to assess whether there needs to be a change in the way Archdiocese will provide pastoral care for the migrant communities.
- **USE OF 'ETHNIC GROUP' AS A TERM:** For purposes of this Review, the words "Ethnic Group" will be used for the following reasons:
 - An established chaplaincy, called by this nomenclature under the auspices of the Archdiocese (e.g., Samoan Chaplaincy and Filipino Chaplaincy)
 - A faith community of parishioners coming from the same ethnicity but does not have an institutional relationship with the Archdiocese (e.g., Korean and Tongan Communities)
 - A faith community coming from a particular ritual tradition (e.g., Syro-Malabar and Assyrians)
 - Some groups identify with a language group and come together as a "mass celebrating community" from varying national backgrounds (e.g., Spanish speakers who are Chilean, Argentinians, Mexicans, etc.)
- **PARTICIPANTS:** The following Ethnic Groups that participated in the study are Samoans (Samoan Chaplaincy, Ioane Vito Centre Community), Indonesians, and Fijians (Multicultural, Indigenous), Spanish-speakers, Assyrians, Syro-Malabar, Myanmar, Indonesians, Tokelauans, Zimbabweans, and one parish-regional report—Marlborough. The Filipino Chaplaincy ran their Review, which the researcher added to this report.
- **SURVEY PARTICIPANTS:** Some Ethnic Groups joined the survey. The researcher analysed two hundred fifty-nine survey forms from the following groups: Samoans (from Samoan Chaplaincy), Fijians (Multicultural), Indonesians, and Spanish speakers.
- **SCOPE AND LIMITATIONS**
 - The researcher works full-time in another role; thus, the time given to the Review was limited.
 - The participants were limited to those actively involved in parishes, meaning those who attend Sunday mass and are contactable by the leaders of the Ethnic Groups.
 - In the study, ethnicity was based on their participation (e.g., by answering the survey for the Samoan chaplaincy, they were assumed to have declared themselves Samoans). Hence, communities with multiple ethnicities, such as the Fijians, prefer to have a separate report (Indigenous Fijians). These dynamics need to be considered more in the design for future studies.

- The Māori was not included in the study, as a Review for the Māori falls under the Vicar for Māori and may require more human resources to conduct.
 - The ownership of the Reports per Ethnic Group belongs to the Ethnic Groups; therefore, there are some variations in the extent of data provided.
 - The study was conducted in English, which could limit how the questions were written, understood, and answered.
 - A gathering with all the participants was conducted on 06 August 2022 to ask the participants as a group for their feedback and recommendations. The result was integrated into the final report. Participants of this gathering were: Fijians (Multicultural), representative from the Indigenous Fijian, Tokelauan, Samoan Chaplaincy, representative from the Filipino Chaplaincy, Zimbabwe, Myanmar, representative from the Spanish-speaking community and representative from the Indonesian community
- The FINAL REPORT consists of the following:
 - Part 1-Demographics
 - Part 2-Results of the Survey
 - Part 3-History, Leadership, and Pastoral Care
 - Part4: Final list of recommendations from the Cultural Groups
 - Appendices: Individual Ethnic Group Reviews

OBJECTIVES

The Review aims to investigate the situation of the Ethnic Group by gathering the following information.ⁱⁱ:

- 1.1 History
- 1.2 The nature of the pastoral care (including sacramental ministry, youth ministry, and formation) provided for the various Ethnic Groups by their chaplaincy/leadership or by other means specific to their culture/ethnicity/language group
- 1.3 The challenges and opportunities in providing pastoral care for Ethnic Groups
- 1.4 The nature of their relationship with the parish and the Archdiocese
- 1.5 The financial resources and obligations of the chaplaincy or Ethnic Group in the Archdiocese. The Review will also explore how Ethnic Groups raise funds.
- 1.6 The number of people involved in the Ethnic Groups (including seasonal workers)
- 1.7 Suggestions on any changes to the provision of pastoral care for migrant communities which would be of benefit to the migrant communities and the wider Archdiocese

METHODOLOGY

- The Review aimed to conduct studies on the ethnic communities and the parishes. This study only covers half of that goal. This study needs to be followed up by another Review of how parishes engage with ethnic communities.
- The researcher used a mixed method of quantitative and qualitative methodologies.
- Participating communities were the primary authors of their report. This report consolidated the different accounts of the participating Ethnic Groups.
- Each Ethnic Group was asked standard questions, which they either answered and put together on their own or with the help of the Researcher (Maya Bernardo). The leaders of the groups signed off the final draft of their Ethnic Group's report.

- Ethical research practices employed were: a) Consulting the Ethnic Groups within the ADW known network regarding the aims and methodology of the study (14 November 2020); b) The researcher approached each group to check if the interview questions and the survey questionnaire; c) To facilitate the writing of the Ethnic Group Reports, the researcher interviewed the leaders, a draft of the report was written and sent back to the leaders (all interviewees) to peruse and signed- off. Approval of the final drafts was mostly sent through emails and saved.

SUMMARY OF FINDINGS

- According to Census 2018: There is a total of 16,680 Ethnic Catholics within the ADW geographical regions of Wellington, Marlborough, Tasman, Nelson, and the West Coast. They comprise 26% of the total number of Catholics (Table 2). There are nineteen defined ethnicities. National boundaries are different from the diocesan boundaries. Thus, the researcher provided some allowance for discrepancies. For instance, this figure does not include the Horowhenua District) and people below the age of fifteen. Hence, figures could be higher than 26%. It should also be noted that these are pre-Covid figures.
- Participants who are active in the parish and their Ethnic Groups are 65% Female and 35% Male (Table 6).
- Twenty-four percent (24%) of the participants are over 60 years old, but there is also a sizeable number of younger ones evenly spread across age groups (Table 7 & 8).

15 younger	16-20	21-30	31-40	41-50	51-60	Sixty over	TOTAL
11%	9%	14.6%	11%	12.6%	18%	24%	100%

- Sixty-nine percent (69%) of the participants are born overseas, and most of them are age 60 or over (35%); those born in New Zealand are mainly in the 21-30 age group (31%) (Table 11A & 11B).
- Seventy-five percent (75%) of participants come from the same pastoral area, whereas 25% come from other pastoral areas (Table 10).
- Ninety percent (90%) of participants live with their families (Table 12). This could mean that parishioners move and support the parish as a group.
- Seventy-six percent (76%) of participants attend 1 to 2 masses a week, which may be the Sunday mass. There seemed to be a good distribution of mass goers across age groups (Table 13).
- Eighty-five percent (85%) of participants consider themselves active in their parishes because they serve actively in ministry (42%) or regularly attend Sunday mass (43%). The greatest participation is with the sixty and over age group (24.5%) (Table 14).
- Over half of the participants (52%) say they are serving in their Ethnic Group's masses, followed by 31% saying they attend the mass if they have the time (Table 15).

- It could also point to a misunderstanding of the question of what "national" means. Ninety percent (90%) of the participants are not involved in any national or other Catholic organisations (such as Caritas or Vinnies) (Table 16). The Samoans consider some of their organisations, such as the Legion of Mary and Divine Mercy, as national organisations. The Vinnies, for example, have volunteers belonging to Ethnic Groups.
- Other Findings (Table 17)
 - Most participants feel welcomed by their parish and think their parish recognises their culture.
 - Most participants feel satisfied with their Ethnic Group. However, in the interview with the representative from the Indigenous Fijian Group, an issue was raised on not providing masses using the Indigenous Fijian language. Thus, there is a distinction between holding mass with one's ethnic community with the mass being celebrated in the homeland language. This distinction may be necessary for communities that have mixed ethnicity.
 - There is a strong positive relationship between the participants feeling integrated into New Zealand and feeling welcomed by the parish and wanting to be involved with the Archdiocese.
- Interview findings (Interviews)
 - History: The impetus for the establishment of Catholic Ethnic Groups is migration. The beginning of these Ethnic Groups is usually marked by the first mass when their native language was used (Table 17). The formation of the groups come with migration. Ethnicities like Samoans came during the fifties and some like the Assyrians, Myanmar and some of the Columbians came in as refugees. Many of the groups are not sure of the history of their formation as a Catholic community in Wellington. This needs to be addressed by each group with the help of the diocese.
 - Leadership structure: Most Ethnic Groups have a formal leadership structure, meaning they have a set of officeholders elected by the members of the communities or individuals who the group informally chooses to coordinate activities. They could have their chaplain or priest appointed by the diocese to look after their community and the officeholders or elected officers. The Tokelauans have parish-based catechists but work together to provide pastoral care for the Tokelauans all over Wellington. There are communities around the masses celebrated by the priests, such as Fr. Gerry Burns and Fr. Don Hornsey, who regularly celebrate Mass in Spanish. Fr. Don Hornsey also provides pastoral care to the Columbians, Myanmar, and Zimbabweans communities. Sr Josefa Tikoisolomone and another lay drive the Fijian mixed-cultural community. The Indigenous Fijians, through Elisapeci Samanunu, come together through a radio broadcasting session where prayers in the Indigenous Fijian language are aired. Elisapeci also manages a Facebook Page for Catholic Indigenous Fijians. The Indonesian and the Indigenous Fijians have informal lay leaders. Most of these leaders, because of their *mana* and involvement in the community, find themselves as leaders. The Spanish speakers are not organised as a cohesive group, as they are composed of disparate individuals and families from different countries in South America (some from Spain) (Table 18).
 - Funding: The ADW pays for the salary of a Lay Pastoral Leader for the Samoan Chaplaincy and the chaplain for the Filipino chaplaincy. The Samoan Chaplaincy supports its activities through membership contributions. The Filipino chaplaincy sustains itself through the donations of members per activity. Other communities

support themselves from membership contributions (Indonesians, Myanmar, Syro-Malabar, Assyrian, and Tongan (Marlborough). Some rely on contributions per activity or need (Tokelauan, Zimbabweans, Spanish-speakers, Fijian and Indigenous Fijians) (Table 3).

- Relationship with the parish: All Ethnic Groups (except Assyrians) rely on their parishes for the sacraments of Baptism, Confirmation, and Marriage. They also participate in the regular Sunday Eucharist. The communities periodically organise masses in their language (e.g., monthly, or special occasions). Most communities organise social gatherings, provide financial support to members in need, and gather members for devotionals and prayer (Table 19).
- Role of the Church in integration: All the interviewees shared that when they came to New Zealand, the Church was one of the first things they looked for, as it is what connects them to home. The Church helped some of them through the parish or organisations like Vinnies in their settlement. Some communities help newcomers adjust to New Zealand life (e.g., furnishing a house, learning how to drive, finding a job, etc.). The community's social events also help make the Participants feel a sense of belonging. The Church does help in the Participants' integration into New Zealand (Table 20).
- Challenges in entering the parish(es): There seems to be no difficulty entering the parishes, as the Church is the first thing they look for when they come to NZ. It is engaging with the parish community where the challenge lies. The biggest challenge is language—not being able to understand the words in the prayers, readings, and homily and being unable to participate. However, this adjustment sits on top of their basic adjustment to the context and culture of New Zealand. The greatest challenge for some of them, as mentioned by the Spanish-speaking community, is finding meaningful work or simply being able to work to support their families. The Filipino chaplaincy conducted a study that names loneliness as the biggest challenge for Filipinos who have been around for 11-15 years, whilst those who are new cite visa/work-related issues (Table 21). The Tokelauan interview reveals the struggle of older people to cope with the changing technologies in communication. They still prefer face-to-face and personal contact.
- Challenges during Covid: Ethnic Groups like Tokelauans and Assyrians do not seem affected. Some communities were able to adapt quickly, like the Indonesians and the Indigenous Fijians. It was assumed that other communities, although not mentioned in the report, rely on online masses from their homeland during lockdown and Level 2 & 3 restrictions. Some communities, like the Samoans, were challenged by not having to hold their Samoan masses. Other communities speak of their worry about their own countries, which are severely affected. The Zimbabweans share that they must send money home; otherwise, their families will not survive (Table 22).
- Recommendations from the Ethnic Groups (Table 23)
 - Many participants are active in their parishes, and they can provide wisdom on how to reach out to more people.
 - Develop a culture of welcome in parishes by greeting and reaching out to new migrant parishioners

- Ensure that Parish Pastoral Councils are representative of the diversity in the parishes. This also goes for other organisations in the diocese/church.
 - Finding ways to help communities organise masses in their language
 - Reach out to the young people, many of whom are transferring to other churches
 - Encourage and support devotions of various faith practices without judgment (e.g., being labelled "old fashion")
 - The ADW to meet with the leaders of the communities at least once a year
 - Gathering with other migrant communities
 - The ADW to organise a Congress where all Catholics can gather for mass, worship, learning workshops, and social activities
 - Provide the assistance and technology to access online masses and faith-formation resources.
- Combined Recommendations from the Interviews and the 06 August 2022 Gathering of Ethnic Leaders and ADW Leaders (See notes on Ethnic Gathering)
 - *Developing leaders*
 - Representation in Parish Pastoral Councils (Interview & Gathering).
 - Tap migrants into leadership and ministerial roles (Interview).
 - *Increasing participation in parishes*
 - Recognition of the present participation of the migrants in the parish (Interview)
 - Encourage and support devotions and spiritual practices without judgement (Interview).
 - Assist in using technology to access online and faith-formation resources (Interview).
 - Visitation from the parish/ parish priest like what other Christian denominations do (from the Myanmar community during the Gathering).
 - Find ways for communities to organise masses in their languages (Interview & Gathering).
 - *Helping migrants feel welcome*
 - Welcome them in their languages (Gathering).
 - Reach out to the newcomers (Gathering).
 - Reach out to those not part of the chaplaincy or the cultural groups (Gathering).
 - *Reach out to the youth*
 - Explore ways to reach out to the youth (Interview & Gathering).
 - Make masses livelier and engaging (Interview & Gathering).
 - Relate the Gospel to real-life experiences (Gathering).
 - *Support from the Archdiocese*
 - Organise more gatherings of ethnic communities (Interview and Gathering).
 - Assists Cultural Group leaders to organise their people (Gathering).
 - Facilitate a way the communities can continue interacting and learning from each other (Interview and Gathering).
 - Educate people on the plight of migrant communities, not just in settling in New Zealand and their concerns for their families back home (This was shared by the Myanmar community who said, "New Zealand does not

understand our suffering”). This could also mean solidarity for the vulnerable in different parts of the world.

- Provide a mechanism for the ADW to coordinate with the migrant communities and vice-versa (Gathering)ⁱⁱⁱ
- *Future survey*
 - The survey (or future survey) should represent the entire diversity of the Church (Gathering)
 - Future surveys should capture or reach out to newcomers in the parish (Gathering)
 - All age groups should be part of the survey (Gathering)
 - More people should be involved in the study (Gathering)

ⁱ In the study, the authors will interchange the use of Ethnic Groups with "Communities". Along the same lines, the study will use Ethnic Catholics to refer to individuals

ⁱⁱThese were derived from Terms of References written by the Office of the Archbishop before this Ethnic Review.

ⁱⁱⁱ This is also nascent to the Review process when the engagement mechanism created by the Review allowed the dissemination of information on the Royal Commission and their participation in the Synod